

RE: MARS Petcare Round 3 vs Round 2 Trade plan Analysis

From: "Nankervis, Luke" <[REDACTED]@effem.com>
 To: Paul Carroll <[REDACTED]@coles.com.au>
 Cc: "Barrett, Lane" <[REDACTED]@effem.com>; "Byrnes, Anthony" <[REDACTED]@effem.com>; "Conkling, Justin" <[REDACTED]@effem.com>
 Date: Wed, 07 Sep 2022 17:36:32 +1000

Hi Paul,

As discussed, please see the below further detail to clarify the PWC analysis.

- **Online Promotions** – our latest proposal refers to promotions for FY24H1 and the \$[REDACTED] of additional value this generates. **This is on top of our commitment for FY23H2 that we provided previously, and therefore this value needs to be considered towards the gap closure.**
- **Gap between sub-category margin calculations** – the key component we believe missing from your calculations on margins are the products that have not been included in this cost price increase, including innovation launched. For Wet Cat specifically, there are a large number of pack groups which are accretive to the total mix and therefore significantly improve the margin position. We've included our calculations for the 52w value of these packs. For the two most notable gaps we've included detail below:
 - **Dry Dog:** Goodo Dry Dog 3kg, My Dog Dry 1.5kg & Pedigree Dry Dog 3kg aren't taking price.
 - These packs have a combined RS of \$[REDACTED] & 5th Margin of \$[REDACTED] which equates to a blended 5th Margin of [REDACTED]%, which is higher than the [REDACTED]% shown in the Coles model, and is driving the 0.2% variance between the Mars & Coles modelling.
 - **Wet Cat:** Innovation/packs not taking price appear to have not been included in your calculation. The packs are Dine Classic Collection Pouch 85g, 12x85g and 24x85g; Dine Pulled 85g and 7x85g; Whiskas Favourites 24x85g and Optimum Wet Cat Pouch 12x85g.
 - These packs have a combined RSV of \$[REDACTED] and 5th of \$[REDACTED], running at [REDACTED]% blended 5th. If you add the below Wet Cat packs to the calculation, it brings blended 5th margin to [REDACTED]%.
- **Dine Creamy Treats**
 - In round 2 proposal, a \$3.20 price point (15% off) at a frequency of 14 was submitted in Item template, we've identified this as an error and adjusted it a \$3.00 price point (20% off) at a frequency of 14 in round 3.
 - Promotional 5th Margin is structured in line with tiering strategy applied to all pack groups, and total blended 5th margin on Dine Creamy Treats is moving from [REDACTED]% to [REDACTED]% (+50 bps) as part of the cost price increase.
 - This may appear as a 'reduction' between round 2 and 3, but this is due to the error in round 2, and still represents progress forward on this pack's margin. This will be the driver of Cat Treats 5th margin appearing backwards between round 2 & 3.
- **Whiskas Milk**
 - Total blended 5th margin is maintained on Whiskas Milk at [REDACTED]%, with same funding structure per current (all defer deal). There was a very small reduction in margin percentage (-9bps) that the analysis called out that we can commit to correcting.
 - The new BSCW is \$[REDACTED] 1c higher than before, and this change is worth \$[REDACTED] of supplier funding and brings 5th margin to [REDACTED]%
- **Temptations 180g**
 - Round 2 proposal had the same volume submitted for 20% & 30% mechanic. We corrected this in Round 3.
 - Promotional 5th Margin is structured in line with tiering strategy applied to all pack group and blended 5th margin on this pack moves from [REDACTED]% to [REDACTED]%
- **Dine Desire 85g**
 - No change to promotional frequency. \$1.90 multibuy previously pulled through as simple price point which we corrected in round 3.
- **Total Promotional Funding Change**
 - We've identified an error in the calculation on our side for total promotional funding – we have this value as \$[REDACTED] in line with PWC's assessment.

Based on round 3, we see the current breakdown of gap as \$[REDACTED] not \$[REDACTED] as stated by PWC once the additional \$[REDACTED] of value from the online plan is added in.

I hope all of the above clarifies the calculations. I will call you in the morning to discuss next steps.

Thanks,

Luke

Luke Nankervis (he/him)
 Customer Development Head|Coles
 Mars Petcare Australia
 M [REDACTED]
 E [REDACTED]@effem.com



We work flexibly at Mars Petcare. I'm sending this email at a time that suits me. Please feel comfortable knowing that I do not expect you to read, respond to, or action it outside your normal working hours

Mars Petcare respectfully acknowledges the Traditional Custodians of the land on which we live and work, and pay our respects to their Elders, past, present and emerging.

CONFIDENTIALITY: This email and any attachments are confidential and may also be privileged. If received in error, please do not disclose the contents to anyone, but notify the sender by return email and delete this email and any attachments from your system. Pricing is at the sole discretion of the retailer.

From: Paul Carroll <[REDACTED]@coles.com.au>
 Sent: Wednesday, 7 September 2022 12:16 PM
 To: Nankervis, Luke <[REDACTED]@effem.com>
 Subject: FW: MARS Petcare Round 3 vs Round 2 Trade plan Analysis

[EXTERNAL]

From: Brian Keane <[REDACTED]@coles.com.au>
 Sent: Tuesday, 6 September 2022 2:51 PM
 To: Paul Carroll <[REDACTED]@coles.com.au>
 Subject: FW: MARS Petcare Round 3 vs Round 2 Trade plan Analysis
 FYI, hot off the press!

From: Mildred Wong <[REDACTED]@coles.com.au>
 Sent: Tuesday, 6 September 2022 2:46 PM
 To: Brian Keane <[REDACTED]@coles.com.au>
 Cc: Vera Ananina <[REDACTED]@coles.com.au>
 Subject: MARS Petcare Round 3 vs Round 2 Trade plan Analysis

Hi Brian,

Find the trade plan summary for round 3 vs round 2 for MARS Pet below. Let us know if you are happy to share. FYI I'll be offline from 2.45 to 4.30 today but happy to send through to Paul after or for you or Vera to send to Paul.

Round 3 vs 2 Summary

Thank you for sharing the Round 3 for Mars Pet. We went through it and below is the summary of the analysis.

In summary, this promo plan delivers additional \$[REDACTED] in supplier funding. Mars Pet is also investing in creating value for shoppers and consumers by transferring 11 groups to EDV proposition at the same discount depth as in the current plan (mixture of financing – BSCW and unit deals).

Compared to round 2 there is a 2.2% increase in 5th Margin \$ and a +41bps increase in 5th Margin %

We did not see any notable pull back of investment compared to round 2 trade plan, except for DINE Treats 4x12g promo group which has had a decrease in 5th margin % (-122bps) where promo has deepened by +5.8%, but unit funding has not changed so promo contribution has dropped -16.7%

CPI Summary

Metric	Impact
Cost Price % Increase Request	13.79%
Annual COGS (Last 12 Months)	\$213.5m
COGS Impact	\$29.4m
Cost Price % Increase Validated	6.10%
COGS Impact Validated	\$13.0m
Gap	(\$16.4m)
[REDACTED]	\$[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	\$[REDACTED]
[REDACTED]	\$[REDACTED]
Gap after round 2	(\$5.4m)
[REDACTED]	\$[REDACTED]
Final Gap after round 3	(\$2.9m)

Round 3 provides +\$[REDACTED] additional funding to Round 2 (\$[REDACTED]) and \$[REDACTED] to Round 1. Most of the gap was mitigated by the three rounds of changes, with the final gap remaining at the level of -\$[REDACTED]

A couple of things to consider:

- The supplier also provided a number of SKUs that were not previously included. These new SKUs were excluded in order to do an accurate comparison of R3 vs R2. These additional SKUs only add an additional \$**REDACTED** in supplier funding and 5th margin \$ **REDACTED**
- The supplier also mentions Online promotion results of \$**REDACTED**, we think they are referring to the previously communicated \$**REDACTED** for online promotion support during the Round 2, and as it is already included, we have not re-added it
- The Supplier has noted that further +\$**REDACTED** in supplier funding was added however our calculations only account for \$**REDACTED**

Financial Summary Round 3 vs Round 2

Round 3 vs Round 2 vs Current Plan Comparison

	Current	Estimate	Round 1 Change from Current	Estimate	Round 2 Change from Round 1	Change from Current	Estimate	Round 3 Change from Round 2	Change from Current
Sales	\$268.3M	\$302.9M	12.9%	\$302.9M	0.0%	12.9%	\$305.9M	1.0%	14.0%
Volume	68,671,008	70,142,119	2.1%	70,150,119	0.0%	2.2%	70,511,885	0.5%	2.7%
ASP	\$3.91	\$4.32	10.5%	\$4.32	0.0%	10.5%	\$4.34	0.5%	11.0%
5th Margin \$	\$ REDACTED	\$ REDACTED	13.2%	\$ REDACTED	1.1%	14.5%	\$ REDACTED	2.2%	17.0%
5th Margin %	REDACTED %	REDACTED %	0.3%	REDACTED %	1.1%	1.4%	REDACTED %	1.2%	2.6%
Total Supplier Funding	\$ REDACTED	\$ REDACTED	19.0%	\$ REDACTED	2.2%	22.5%	\$ REDACTED	4.3%	27.7%
Non-Promo funding	\$ REDACTED	\$ REDACTED	1.5%	\$ REDACTED	22.8%	24.7%	\$ REDACTED	11.1%	38.5%
Promo funding	\$ REDACTED	\$ REDACTED	28.4%	\$ REDACTED	-5.4%	21.5%	\$ REDACTED	1.1%	22.7%
Total Supplier Funding as a % of Sales	REDACTED %	REDACTED %	6.1%	REDACTED %	2.2%	8.5%	REDACTED %	3.3%	12.0%

- The Round 3 plan delivers +\$**REDACTED** (+17.0%) increase in 5th Margin vs the current plan and \$**REDACTED** (+1.2%) increase vs the R2
- 5th Margin percentage increased from **REDACTED**% in the R2 up to **REDACTED**% in the R3
- Total Supplier Funding is increasing by +\$**REDACTED** (+27.7%) vs the current plan and +\$**REDACTED** (4.3%) vs R2. The driver is increased non-promotion funding (BSCW) and increasing unit deals across some promo groups

Round 3 vs Round 2 Comparison

	Sales		Volume		ASP		5th Margin \$		5th Margin %		Total Supplier Funding		Total Supplier Funding as a % of Sales		5th Margin/Unit	Supplier Funding/Unit
Group Name	New	% Change	New	% Change	New	% Change	New	% Change	New	Change (BPS)	New	% Change	New	Change (BPS)	Change +/-	Change +/-
Dry Cat	\$29,241,807	1.1%	3,499,295	1.1%	\$8.59	(0.0%)	REDACTED	3.2%	REDACTED %	84 bps	REDACTED	5.0%	REDACTED %	97 bps	\$0.05	\$0.08
Dry Dog	\$25,779,839	0.0%	1,294,869	0.0%	\$19.91	0.0%	REDACTED	0.0%	REDACTED %	(0 bps)	REDACTED	0.0%	REDACTED %	(0 bps)	\$0.00	\$0.00
Wet Cat	\$82,477,638	0.7%	25,235,595	0.2%	\$3.27	0.0%	REDACTED	1.9%	REDACTED %	30 bps	REDACTED	3.4%	REDACTED %	43 bps	\$0.02	\$0.02
Wet Dog	\$98,828,661	0.7%	28,996,781	0.3%	\$2.98	0.5%	REDACTED	2.9%	REDACTED %	66 bps	REDACTED	5.1%	REDACTED %	98 bps	\$0.02	\$0.03
Cat Treats	\$16,796,663	1.4%	4,098,086	2.7%	\$4.09	(1.3%)	REDACTED	0.2%	REDACTED %	(49 bps)	REDACTED	6.0%	REDACTED %	60 bps	-\$0.04	\$0.02
Dog Treats	\$52,906,151	1.1%	6,440,121	0.8%	\$8.22	0.5%	REDACTED	2.1%	REDACTED %	38 bps	REDACTED	4.4%	REDACTED %	67 bps	\$0.05	\$0.05
Drinks	\$1,134,646	7.0%	312,000	7.2%	\$3.64	(0.2%)	REDACTED	6.6%	REDACTED %	(9 bps)	REDACTED	8.3%	REDACTED %	7 bps	-\$0.01	\$0.00
Litter	\$10,637,754	5.8%	713,694	6.6%	\$14.91	(0.7%)	REDACTED	5.9%	REDACTED %	5 bps	REDACTED	11.1%	REDACTED %	27 bps	-\$0.04	\$0.03
Wash & Grooming	\$163,469	-	9,464	-	\$17.27	-	REDACTED	-	REDACTED %	0 bps	REDACTED	-	REDACTED %	0 bps	\$0.00	\$0.00
Grand Total	\$305,906,328	1.0%	70,511,885	0.5%	\$4.34	0.6%	\$ REDACTED	2.2%	REDACTED %	41 bps	\$ REDACTED	4.3%	REDACTED %	62 bps	\$0.02	\$0.03

- 5th Margin \$ and 5th Margin % increase overall. However, there are two subcategories showing a decrease in 5th margin % these are:
 - Cat Treats (-49bps) – driven by DINE Treats 4x12g promo group (-122bps) where promo has deepened by +5.8% (to **REDACTED**%), but unit funding has not changed so promo contribution has dropped -16.7%.
 - Drinks (-9bps) – driven by WHISKAS Milk 1l where a shift to EDV means 5th Margin declines slightly given the new price point is now applied for all weeks
 - All other subcategories and promo groups are showing 5th margin % improvement apart from those listed above and TEMPTATIONS 180g which has (-2bps) decline in 5th margin % due to estimating volume increases in the highest promo mechanic which has a lower 5th margin % compared to other mechanics
- Looking at volumes there are some larger expected increases in volume
 - Cat Treats (+2.7%) - Driven by 3-7% increase in volumes across promo groups where there is a shift to EDV or deepening of promotions. However, it should be noted that DINE Treats 4x12g promo group where the promo has deepened to 19.9%, it is still below the 20% threshold for better perceived shopper value and advertising in catalogues
 - Drinks (+7.2%) – driven by increases in volumes for WHISKAS Milk 1l where a shift to EDV (+7.2%) due to changing to an EDV mechanic that creates consistent lower price point
 - Litter (+6.6%) – driven by increases in volumes for CATSAN Crystals 2kg (+12%) due to changing to an EDV mechanic

Group Name	Supplier	5th Margin %	Our Model	Difference
Dry Cat	REDACTED	REDACTED %	REDACTED %	0.1%
Dry Dog	REDACTED	REDACTED %	REDACTED %	(0.2%)
Wet Cat	REDACTED	REDACTED %	REDACTED %	(1.4%)
Wet Dog	REDACTED	REDACTED %	REDACTED %	(0.0%)
Cat Treats	REDACTED	REDACTED %	REDACTED %	(0.1%)
Dog Treats	REDACTED	REDACTED %	REDACTED %	0.2%
Drinks	REDACTED	REDACTED %	REDACTED %	(0.0%)
Litter	REDACTED	REDACTED %	REDACTED %	(0.0%)
Wash & Grooming	REDACTED	REDACTED %	REDACTED %	(0.0%)
Grand Total	REDACTED	REDACTED %	REDACTED %	(0.2%)

- Looking at the stated 5th Margin calculations provided by the supplier compared to our calculations there is a difference of 0.2% overall. With

some differences in 5th margin for Dry Dog, Wet Cat and Cat Treats – as shown below in the table

Key Changes in Promotion Plan for Round 3 vs Round 2

Attached ppt showcases the key changes by subcategory

- BSCW has increased overall as demonstrated by increase in non-promotional funding

- There has been a mixture of unit funding increases and decreases combined with BSCW adjustments, but these do not seem to have a negative impact on 5th Margin % for the majority of groups
- Notable change to EDV mechanic for the following groups keeping the same discount depth:

Promo Group	BSCW	Unit funding	Promo contribution
CAISAN Crystals 2kg	REDACTED	REDACTED	REDACTED %
MYDOGO Tray 24x100g	REDACTED	REDACTED	REDACTED %
OPTIMUM Tray MP (24x100g)	REDACTED	REDACTED	REDACTED %
OPTIMUM Dry Dog 15kg	REDACTED	REDACTED	REDACTED %
PEDIGREE Dentastix 56pk	REDACTED	REDACTED	REDACTED %
SCHMACKOS Dog Treats 1kg	REDACTED	REDACTED	REDACTED %
TEMPTATIONS 350g	REDACTED	REDACTED	REDACTED %
DINE Daily MVMS 14x85g	REDACTED	REDACTED	REDACTED %
WHISKAS OHISO Pch 24x85g	REDACTED	REDACTED	REDACTED %
WHISKAS Dry 3kg	REDACTED	REDACTED	REDACTED %
WHISKAS Milk 1L	REDACTED	REDACTED	REDACTED %

Note: actuals according to the new plan; promo contribution incorporates unit funding only

There is a mixture of using BSCW and unit funding to fund the EDV. However for Whiskas Milk only BSCW is used to fund the EDV

- DINE Daily SVMS 7x85g – For the 33.3% mechanic – drop in unit funding of -\$**REDACTED** but offset by BSCW increases of +\$**REDACTED**
- DINE Desire 85g has introduced a Multibuy promo (5 for \$9.50) for 20 weeks
- PEDIGREE Dentastix 28 has introduced a 40% promo mechanic for 1 weeks, also decreased unit funding for existing mechanics but offset with an increase of +\$**REDACTED** in BSCW
- Optimum Dry Cat – increased BSCW by +\$**REDACTED**
- DINE Treats 4x12g promo group has had a decrease in 5th margin % (-122bps) where promo has deepened by +5.8%, but unit funding has not changed so promo contribution has dropped -16.7%

Kind Regards
Mildred Wong

This email and any attachments may contain privileged and confidential information and are intended for the named addressee only. If you have received this e-mail in error, please notify the sender and delete this e-mail immediately. Any confidentiality, privilege or copyright is not waived or lost because this e-mail has been sent to you in error. It is your responsibility to check this e-mail and any attachments for viruses. No warranty is made that this material is free from computer virus or any other defect or error. Any loss/damage incurred by using this material is not the sender's responsibility. The sender's entire liability will be limited to resupplying the material.